UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06110121 8

# CRIMINAL LAW

Alan Brudner

## VOLUME I

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the Faculty of Law,
University of Toronto

2009-2010

Storage

KE
8808.5
.B78
2009
v.1
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP - 1 2009

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# CRIMINAL LAW

**Alan Brudner**

## VOLUME I

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

2009-2010

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/criminallaw01brud_11

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## (Volume I)


**Chapter One: The Aims of Punishment**

Bentham, Principles of Morals and Legislation ..... 1

C.S. Lewis, "The Humanitarian Theory of Punishment" ..... 5

Hegel, Philosophy of Right ..... 9

Alan Brudner, "*Commentary*: In Defence of Retributivism" ..... 14

**Chapter Two: The Principle of Legality**

*Shaw v. Director of Public Prosecutions* ..... 18

*R. v. Nova Scotia Pharmaceutical Society* ..... 25

**Chapter Three: The Presumption of Innocence**

*Woolmington v. D.P.P.* ..... 32

*R. v. Oakes* ..... 37

*R. v. Whyte* ..... 44

*Downey v. The Queen* ..... 51

*R. v. Lifchus* ..... 60

**Chapter Four: Actus Reus**

*R. v. Corrier* ..... 66

*R. v. Williams* ..... 69

**A) Voluntariness**

*Rex v. Larsonneur* ..... 77

*Hill v. Baxter* ..... 78

**B) Omissions**

A Penal Code Prepared by the Indian Law Commissioners ..... 80

*People v. Beardsley* ..... 82

*The Queen v. Instan* ..... 86

*Fagan v. Commissioner of Metropolitan Police* ..... 88

*R. v. Miller* ..... 91

LRCC, Working Paper #46, Omissions ..... 93

C) Causation

*R. v. Winning* ..... 96

*Commonwealth v. Moyer* ..... 96

*R. v. Roberts* ..... 99

*The Queen v. Jordan* ..... 101

*R. v. Smith* ..... 103

*People v. Lewis* ..... 106

*Pagett v. The Queen* ..... 107

The American Law Institute's Model Penal Code ..... 109

*R. v. Cheshire* ..... 110

*R. v. Smithers* ..... 115

*R. v. Blaue* ..... 116

*R. v. Cribbin* ..... 119

*R. v. Nette* ..... 126

**Chapter Five: Inchoate Crimes**

**I. Attempts**

A) Intent

*Lajoie v. The Queen* ..... 143

*R. v. Ancio* ..... 147

B) Actus Reus

*The King v. Robinson* ..... 153

*The King v. Barker* ..... 156

*R. v. Cline* ..... 160

*R. v. Sorrell and Bondett* ..... 165

*Deutsch v. The Queen* ..... 170

LRCC Draft Criminal Code ..... 174

C) The Relevance of Impossibility

*R. v. Scott* ..... 176

*R. v. Smith (Roger)* ..... 177

*R. v. Shivpuri* ..... 181
*USA v. Dynar* ..... 187

**II. Counselling**

*R. v. McLeod et al.* ..... 203
*R. v. Gordon and Gordon* ..... 204
*R. v. Lepage* ..... 205
LRCC Draft Criminal Code ..... 205

**Chapter Six: Mens Rea**

*R. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie* ..... 207
Barbara Wooton, Crime and the Criminal Law ..... 207
H.L.A. Hart, Punishment and Responsibility ..... 210

**A) Intention and Motive**

*Lewis v. The Queen* ..... 215
*R. v. Steane* ..... 220
*Dunbar v. The King* ..... 222
*Paquette v. The Queen* ..... 224
*R. v. Hibbert* ..... 226

**B) Recklessness**

*R. v. Caldwell* ..... 240
*R. v. G and another* ..... 243
*R. v. Tutton and Tutton* ..... 253
*R. v. Hundal* ..... 265
*R v. Beatty* ..... 272
Brenda M. Baker, "Mens Rea & Negligence" ..... 285
American Law Institute's Model Penal Code ..... 289

**Chapter Seven: Departures from Mens Rea**

**A) Constructive Murder**

Burns and Reid, "From Felony Murder to Accomplice Felony Attempted Murder" ..... 292
*R. v. Vaillancourt* ..... 294
The Law Reform Commission of Canada Working Paper 33, Homicide ..... 305

LRCC Draft Criminal Code ..... 308
*R. v. Martineau* ..... 309

**B) Foreseeability of Harm**

*R. v. DeSousa* ..... 321
*R. v. Creighton* ..... 329

**C) Strict and Absolute Liability**

Morris and Howard, "Strict Responsibility" ..... 352
*Rex v. Ping Yuen* ..... 355
*Beaver v. The Queen* ..... 357
*R. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie* ..... 362
*Reference Re: Section 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act* ..... 368
*Wholesale Travel Group Inc. v. The Queen* ..... 374

**Chapter Eight: Parties to Offences**

*R. v. Kulbacki* ..... 404
*R. v. Salajko* ..... 405
*Dunlop and Sylvester v. The Queen* ..... 406
*R. v. Bainbridge* ..... 412
*R. v. Logan et al.* ..... 414
LRCC Draft Criminal Code ..... 421